Cell-mediated immunity during syphilis

A review

CHARLES S. PAVIA, JAMES D. FOLDS, AND JOEL B. BASEMAN

From the Department of Bacteriology and Immunology, School of Medicine, University of North Carolina, North Carolina 27514, USA

SUMMARY Evidence is presented which reinforces the complexity of the host-parasite interaction during the course of syphilis. Infection with Treponema pallidum evokes a complicated antibody response and an assortment of cell-mediated immune reactions in the host. It appears that humoral immunity plays a minor role towards the complete elimination of syphilitic infection while the cellular limb of the immune response may be an important host defence mechanism. Information now available indicates that a state of anergy, or immunosuppression, exists in the early stages of human and experimental rabbit syphilis based upon negative skin reactions to T. pallidum antigen(s), the abnormal histological appearance of lymphoid organs, and impaired in vitro lymphocyte reactivity. It is also evident that in the later stages of the disease cellular immunity becomes activated as delayed type skin reactions can normally be elicited in tertiary syphilitics and lymphocyte behaviour in cell culture appears normal. Several mechanisms have been invoked to explain the delay in an effective immune response against syphilitic infection and the duration of the disease: (1) a capsule-like substance on the outer surface of virulant T. pallidum may act as a barrier against treponemical antibody; (2) this material and other biological properties of virulent treponemes could enable spirochaetes to escape being engulfed by macrophages and other phagocytic cells; (3) antigenic competition among different treponemal antigens causing partial tolerance; (4) T. pallidum infection may bring about the elaboration of immunosuppressive substances of host or treponemal origin which inhibit the proper function of lymphocytes, macrophages, and other cell types.

Introduction

Since Schaudinn and Hoffman (1905) identified Treponema pallidum as the causative agent of syphilis, the immunological phenomena associated with the disease have intrigued researchers and clinicians. During the past seven decades attempts to grow virulent T. pallidum on artificial media and to develop a successful vaccine have proved fruitless although there have been several unconfirmed reports claiming successful in vitro cultivation of the pathogenic spirochaete (Noguchi, 1911; Jones et al., 1976). Without cultivable virulent treponemes, pure organisms devoid of host tissues are not available in the quantities needed for biological and immunological studies. Consequently the nature of the basic immunological mechanisms elicited in the diseased host by the fastidious spirochaete or its fractions remains an enigma. Despite these obstacles considerable information has accumulated concerning antibody formation, cell-mediated immune reactions, and other aspects of host resistance to syphilitic infection (Turner and Hollander, 1957; Cannefax, 1965; Wigfield, 1965).

ANTIBODY FORMATION

Infection with T. pallidum stimulates the host defence mechanisms and provokes a complex antibody response. Data strongly indicate that at least two varieties of antibody are produced as syphilis progresses from early to late stages. One type (Wassermann or reagin) is non-specific and reacts primarily with tissue extracts composed of lipids; the other type (immobilising, agglutinating, fluorescent, treponemal) is specific since it reacts with some,
Cell-mediated immunity during syphilis

as yet, unidentified component(s) of the treponeme. It has been reported that one or more of these antibodies are treponemical and are supposedly protective (Nelson and Meyer, 1949). However the role of humoral immunity has not been delineated as some individuals with syphilis progress through primary, secondary, and tertiary stages of infection despite the formation of these various antibodies. Furthermore attempts to demonstrate a humoral mechanism by in vivo passive immunisation experiments with presumably immune syphilitic sera from T. pallidum infected rabbits have had limited success (Turner et al., 1973; Weiser et al., 1976) thereby suggesting that antitreponemal antibodies provide, at best, partial protection against syphilitic infection.

CELL-MEDIATED IMMUNITY

The part played by cell-mediated immunity (CMI) in the host defence against T. pallidum infection has also not been determined. Before the work of the past 10 years on the possible role of cellular immunity in syphilis, very little information was available on this aspect of the host response. In the early part of this century Noguchi (1911, 1912) was able to obtain a skin reaction using an extract of pure cultures of T. pallidum which was termed luetin. He found that an intradermal injection of luetin after repeated injections of either living or dead T. pallidum into rabbit testes elicited a local inflammatory reaction, and yet there was no reaction in rabbits suffering from acute orchitis. He also demonstrated similar skin reactions (sometimes severe) in tertiary stages of human syphilis, while those patients in the primary and secondary stages exhibited occasional reactions or mild ones. In contrast to Noguchi’s findings, Rich et al. (1933) were unable to demonstrate any allergic type reactions in previously infected rabbits when reinfected with virulent T. pallidum at periods ranging from 28 to 482 days after the initial immunising infection. These authors concluded that allergic inflammation may not be associated with any acquired immunity in experimental rabbit syphilis. In another report, Marshak and Rothman (1951) found that only patients who had acquired gummatous or congenital syphilis gave strong tuberculin-type reactions to a purified suspension of T. pallidum prepared from infected rabbit testes, while six of seven individuals with secondary acquired syphilis yielded negative reactions. Similarly only 60% of rabbits infected for a two- to 12-month period gave a positive skin reaction to the treponemal extract. No correlation existed between the duration of the infection and the degree of skin reaction. An analogous study conducted by a French group (Thivolet et al., 1953) showed that delayed-type skin reactions to dead T. pallidum were rarely elicited in patients with primary and secondary syphilis, whereas a large percentage of tertiary syphilitics reacted positively to intradermal injection of this treponemal extract. Other experiments performed by Laird and Thorburn (1966) showed that 67% of their patients with tertiary syphilis gave delayed-type hypersensitivity reaction to an extract of T. pallidum, the luotest, which occurred after repeated challenge. The unresponsiveness in early syphilis seems to be specific to T. pallidum antigens since skin reactions to several non-treponemal antigens—such as, mumps, old tuberculin, and varidase—were reported in patients at various stages of syphilis (Wright and Grimble, 1974).

Some investigations have been performed relating the histological appearance of lymphoid tissues with the presence of T. pallidum infection. In a study in which lymph nodes of 20 patients with early syphilis were removed, Turner and Wright (1973) were able to show a depletion of lymphocytes in the paracortical areas of these tissues. Numerous treponemes were found in these areas using the silver impregnation technique. Levene et al. (1971) while conducting a study of infants dying from congenital syphilis discovered a diminution of lymphocytes in the area around the central arteriole of the spleen. Comparable results were obtained by Festenstein et al. (1967) who infected neonatal rabbits with T. pallidum. These infected animals exhibited a runting syndrome in which death usually occurred within three months. Depletion of lymphocytes in the white pulp areas of the spleens of these rabbits was found although treponemal invasion of this organ was not observed. The paracortical areas of lymph nodes and the area around the central splenic artery are thymus-dependent areas involved in mediating cellular immune reactions of the host, and defective CMI is associated with lymphocyte depletion in these areas (Parrott et al., 1966). From these studies on the structural appearance of lymphoid tissue it is apparent that thymus-dependent (T-cell) areas are adversely affected during syphilitic infection.

Another parameter used to examine the cellular mechanisms involved in T. pallidum infection has been the attempt by several investigators to activate the reticuloendothelial system by inoculating rabbits with BCG* organisms and then monitoring what effect this treatment had on the course of experimental disease (Graves and Johnson, 1975; Schell et al., 1975b). In these studies prior injection with BCG was unsuccessful in preventing the develop-

*BCG is a viable attenuated strain of Mycobacterium bovis which in the form of a vaccine has been able to confer protection against mycobacterial infection and to stimulate non-specifically CMI in certain experimental models.
ment of syphilitic lesions in rabbits subsequently inoculated with virulent *T. pallidum*. Although there was a delay in the onset of lesions when immune treponemal serum was administered simultaneously with BCG, no evidence was found suggesting a synergistic protective effect between the activated macrophages and the antitreponemal antibodies. Despite these results whereby enhanced resistance to treponemal infection owing to presumably armed macrophages was not detected in BCG-infected animals, Schell and Musher (1974) have presented indirect evidence favouring the suggestion that infection with *T. pallidum* stimulates CMI. Basically they followed the model established by Blanden et al. (1969) in which infection by one organism confers resistance to infection with an antigenically unrelated organism. Rabbits were infected first with virulent *T. pallidum* and then challenged with *Listeria monocytogenes*. Resistance to *Listeria* infection was then evaluated weekly by measuring the number of organisms found in the spleens and livers of the infected animals. Enhanced ability to suppress the growth of *Listeria* was detected in the rabbits’ livers between the third and sixth week after intravenous infection with virulent *T. pallidum*. However there was no indication that treponemes were engulfed by these activated phagocytic cells. Additionally, in a manner similar to the adoptive transfer model of Mackaness and Hill (1969), spleen cells from syphilitic rabbits together with *T. pallidum* were transferred to normal rabbits (Schell et al., 1975a). A significant degree of resistance to subsequent challenge inoculation with *Listeria* was produced in the recipient animals. The results were based on the number of *Listeria* in the livers and spleens of these rabbits. When the spleen cells from the infected donor rabbits were first reacted with a highly specific antirabbit thymus serum and complement, Schell et al. (1975a) showed that transfer of immunity was abrogated indicating that thymus-dependent immunity was responsible for conferring resistance to *Listeria* infection. In a similar fashion Metzger and Smogor (1975) demonstrated partial immunity to *T. pallidum* infection by adoptive transfer of lymph node lymphocytes from syphilitic rabbits to normal ones. These investigators showed that a reduced number or a delayed incubation or absence of lesions occurred in the recipient animals after intradermal challenge with virulent *T. pallidum*. However since outbred animals were used in these experiments partial protection could have resulted from non-specific sensitisation occurring when allogeneic cells present in the putative immuno-competent lymphocyte population were transferred from infected to normal rabbits.

*In vitro* tests for CMI, notably lymphocyte trans-

formation and cell migration inhibition, have been used to monitor the cellular immune capability of man and animals to various diseases (Kantor, 1975; Rocklin, 1976) including syphilis (Badanoiu et al., 1969; Levene et al., 1969; Janot et al., 1971; Fulford and Brostoff, 1972; Musher et al., 1974; Friedman and Turk, 1975; Musher et al., 1975; Wicher and Wicher, 1975; From et al., 1976; Pavia et al., 1976, 1977a). In the lymphocyte transformation assay lymphoid cells usually derived from peripheral blood are cultured with a suitable stimulant, especially a mitogen—such as, phytohaemagglutinin (PHA), or concanavalin A (Con A), or a specific test antigen—in this case a treponemal preparation. The mitogen non-specifically induces a large number of cells to enlarge, proliferate, and undergo DNA synthesis whereas a narrower range of cells experience similar changes in a specific response to the antigen. The degree of blastogenesis is measured either by microscopical examination of the blast cells or more accurately by incorporating a radioactively labelled DNA precursor into newly synthesised DNA. The amount of label incorporated and therefore the rate of DNA synthesis is determined usually by scintillation counting which gives a quantitative assessment of lymphocyte responsiveness and presumably functional capacity. The results of this test using lymphocytes from syphilitic patients have so far been inconsistent. Several European investigators have been able to transform cells from individuals with syphilis. Badanoiu et al. (1969) showed that positive lymphocyte responses to PHA and an antigen composed of *T. pallidum* (Nichols strain) can regularly be elicited from patients with syphilis at various stages of infection. In another study, Janot et al. (1971) using a saline suspension of the Nichols strain of *T. pallidum* as stimulant, demonstrated increased numbers of lymphoblastoid-like cells based upon the morphology of the lymphocyte populations in four of six patients with primary, nine of 11 with secondary, five of six with congenital syphilis, as well as all of 18 with cardiovascular or neurosyphilis, 30 with latent, and 12 patients with treated syphilis. Likewise Friedman and Turk (1975) reported elevated blastogenic responses to a *T. pallidum* preparation in patients with seropositive primary infection and those in the papular stage of secondary syphilis, although patients in the macular stage of disease gave poor responses. In addition individuals undergoing treatment with drugs exhibited marked lymphocyte reactivity to the *T. pallidum* antigen. Data contrary to these findings have been provided by other investigators. Levene et al. (1969) demonstrated that patients with primary and secondary syphilis had an impaired lymphocyte response to PHA. At the
same time plasma from patients with secondary syphilis was found to cause reduced levels of blastogenesis of normal lymphocytes. Other workers (Kantor, 1975; From et al., 1976) have shown that serum or plasma from diseased patients hampered the PHA or Con A induced response of normal lymphocytes. In two studies Mushet et al. (1974, 1975) showed that primary and secondary syphilitics exhibited a suppressed in vitro lymphocyte response to treponemal antigens derived from Treponema refringens, Treponema phagedenis biotype Reiter, and T. pallidum, and to non-treponemal antigens such as Candida and trichophyins. However these patients demonstrated a normal lymphocyte response to PHA, pokeweed mitogen, and streptolysin O. Moreover syphilitic serum possessed no in vitro inhibitory activity. Another in vitro correlate of CMI, the leucocyte migration inhibition test, has been used in several studies for examining the cellular response of syphilitic patients (Fulford and Brostoff, 1972; From et al., 1976) and of experimentally infected rabbits (Wicher and Wicher, 1975; Metzger et al., 1977). In this particular assay migration inhibition is measured directly using peripheral blood leucocytes or indirectly using sensitised lymphocytes and guinea-pig macrophages and placing them either in capillary tubes or in agar in the presence or absence of appropriate antigen. Cell migration is measured between 24 and 48 hours later and the relative areas of migration are determined, usually by planimetry, and the amount of inhibition of cell migration is calculated. Inhibition of cell migration is closely associated with the presence of in vivo cellular hypersensitivity of the host to that antigen (Rocklin, 1976). Using this assay Fulford and Brostoff (1972) assessed the reaction of 47 patients who were at various stages of syphilis to a commercial preparation of Reiter protein as antigen. They found that in 19 cases of primary syphilis, patients exhibited stimulation of migration; 24 patients with either secondary or latent syphilis showed neither stimulation nor inhibition. Only in those individuals with late active syphilis was there clear evidence of inhibition of migration which could be interpreted as a manifestation of CMI to Reiter protein. In a similar report (From et al., 1976), it was demonstrated that increased cellular reactivity evaluated by migration inhibition in response to a T. pallidum antigen became evident after syphilitic patients received drug treatment. Another study (Wicher and Wicher, 1975) investigated the cellular response of syphilitic rabbits by measuring leucocyte migration in agarose using a T. pallidum antigen, a commercial Reiter antigen, and cardiolipin reagent as stimulants. A bimodal response was demonstrated by cells in the presence of each of the commercial preparations and a low concentration of T. pallidum antigen. During the first four weeks of syphilitic infection, stimulation of leucocyte migration occurred (indicative of weak CMI), while after this period inhibition of migration was observed (indicative of strong CMI). When cells were exposed to a higher concentration of T. pallidum antigen inhibition of migration was seen from the first week of infection onwards. Similar data have been given by Metzger et al. (1977) in a long-term study whereby the macrophage migration inhibition test was used for evaluating the cellular response during experimental disease. It was demonstrated that from one month after infection lymphocytes from T. pallidum infected rabbits exposed in vitro to a sonicated treponemal suspension significantly inhibited the migration of guinea-pig macrophages. The inhibitory effect was maintained for at least two years of infection except for a transient decrease in inhibition activity between the fourth and sixth month.

In our series of experiments we investigated the CMI response of rabbits infected with T. pallidum by employing the lymphocyte transformation assay (Pavia et al., 1976, 1977a) and the macrophage migration inhibition test (Pavia et al., 1977b). Although the rabbit may not be suitable for certain immunological studies we chose this animal for our investigation as experimental infection in the rabbit has so far been the model of choice in attempting to elucidate the nature of immunological phenomena associated with the disease and for making comparisons with human syphilis. Furthermore a local lesion can be readily produced at the site of inoculation of virulent T. pallidum and the clinical course of the disease can easily be monitored as the infection progresses from early to late stages. The study consisted of collecting blood weekly from T. pallidum infected rabbits and culturing their peripheral blood lymphocytes with various mitogens and Reiter treponemal antigen. During the first three or four weeks of infection the transformation of lymphocytes from infected rabbits by Con A, PHA, and pokeweed mitogen was suppressed when compared with the lymphocyte response of non-infected control rabbits. In addition, serum from the donor rabbit significantly reduced the Con A-induced response of autologous lymphocytes. After four weeks, normal levels of blastogenesis were usually observed. When lymphocytes from these same infected animals were exposed in vitro to antirabbit immunoglobulin and to a Reiter treponemal preparation a different pattern emerged. Throughout the duration of infection normal levels of blast transformation were obtained in response to these stimulants.

In the next sequence of experiments peritoneal
exudate cells from *T. pallidum* infected rabbits were collected every two weeks and examined for migration inhibition activity in the presence of *T. phagedenis* biotype Reiter. Between five and 15 weeks after infection there was a significant inhibition of macrophage migration in response to three different concentrations of the Reiter treponeme. Before this period little or no inhibition had been evident. The inhibitory effect manifested in these animals could be interpreted as a response by sensitised cells to antigenic determinants of the Reiter treponeme which are shared with the virulent Nichols *T. pallidum* (Meyer and Hunter, 1967).

Our findings suggested an interrelationship between the appearance and regression of symptomatic infection and the in vitro response to T-cell mitogens (Con A, PHA, pokeweed mitogen) in the transformation test and *T. phagedenis* biotype Reiter in the migration inhibition assay. During the first few weeks of infection in which widespread dissemination of organisms occurred and severe ulcerative lesions developed the rabbits manifested poor lymphocyte reactivity, whereas during remission when lesions were subsiding (four to six weeks after infection) blastogenesis and migration inhibition markedly increased. This may reflect heightened T-cell reactivity at this stage of infection. Furthermore the normal blastogenic response to anti-immunoglobulins (putative B-cell mitogens) may correlate with the initiation of antibody synthesis to treponemal antigens and thus reflect an intact humoral expression of immunity in syphilis.

Recently we have reinforced previous data describing the apparent selectivity of the lymphocyte response during experimental *T. pallidum* infection by separating rabbit lymphocytes into T- and B-cell populations and monitoring their in vitro response to appropriate mitogens and *T. pallidum* antigen(s) (Pavia et al., 1977c). It was clear that Con A and PHA-induced proliferation of the purified T cells was markedly reduced during early infection while the response to classical B-cell mitogens was normal. In striking contrast, the same enriched T-cell population from infected animals was stimulated by *T. pallidum* antigen(s). However autologous syphilitic serum significantly diminished the in vitro stimulatory effects of *T. pallidum* antigen(s) on the enriched T cells. A relevant conclusion from these studies is that during early disease the T cells that exist in the infected host respond poorly to certain mitogens while these cells, or a subpopulation of them, are readily stimulated by *T. pallidum*. This latter phenomenon, in turn, is subject to the regulatory effects of syphilitic serum which could adversely affect in vivo as well as in vitro lymphocyte reactivity.

**Proposed mechanisms of immunity in syphilis**

Limited information is available concerning the nature of immune mechanisms during *T. pallidum* infection. Although a role for humoral immunity was implicated when it was apparently demonstrated that protective antibodies directed against *T. pallidum* were present in serum taken from infected patients and rabbits (Turner, 1939; Turner et al., 1948), it was later suggested (Turner and Hollander, 1957) that the phenomena probably represented an in vitro effect rather than a direct in vivo consequence. Also the general pattern of evidence indicates little correlation between the level of antibody and the degree of immunity to challenge of previously infected or immunised rabbits (Magnuson et al., 1951; Metzger et al., 1969; Miller, 1973) and it has also been demonstrated that complete protection against experimental *T. pallidum* infection can be accomplished without the immediate presence of circulating antibody (Miller, 1973).

A relationship may exist between the inherent properties of the infectious treponeme and the role of immune mechanisms in syphilis. Factors intrinsic to the treponeme may enable it to circumvent or block immunological attack. It has recently been shown (Zeigler et al., 1976) that the virulent Nichols strain of *T. pallidum* possesses an extracellular layer. This outer coat was observed in vivo and in vitro after the organisms were exposed to ruthenium red. Before this report, only presumptive evidence for this structural component existed (Metzger et al., 1961; Christiansen, 1963). Some researchers (Metzger et al., 1961; Metzger, 1962; Miller, 1967) have advanced the hypothesis that acquired resistance may depend on the association between treponemical antibody and this outer capsule-like material. It has been suggested that treponemical antibody can exert an inhibitory effect on the organisms once the outer capsule has been removed or somehow been stripped off. What mechanisms are involved in the disappearance of this outer coat are not known but the relatively slow development of immunity to *T. pallidum* infection may be directly related to the poor antigenic nature of this outer material and its half life in vivo.

Since the role played by antibody towards the eradication of syphilitic infection is not clear it may be necessary to invoke cell-mediated immune phenomena as important factors in the infectious process. It has already been demonstrated (Turner and Hollander, 1957) that vaccines consisting of dead or purified antigen preparations of *T. pallidum* have generally been unsuccessful in providing effective protection against treponemal infection despite the formation of an abundance of antibody. However
Complete resistance to *T. pallidum* infection has been produced by prior injections of motile virulent treponemes attenuated by γ-irradiation (Miller, 1973). Elberg (1973) showed that efficient induction of CMI in certain microbial infections requires living vaccines, whereas killed vaccines or purified bacterial antigens are less efficient forms of immunophylaxis. Taken together, these facts suggest that protection against *T. pallidum* infection may depend on a specifically activated cellular immune system. In addition it is becoming apparent that the cellular limb of the immune response is defective in the highly infectious early stages of syphilis and is mobilised at other stages. Antigenic competition has been considered a possible candidate underlying the hyporeactive state in early disease (Wright and Grimble, 1974). If *T. pallidum* possesses multiple antigenic determinants (and this seems likely) one antigen could selectively compete and interfere with the response to other antigens, thereby creating a condition of partial or split tolerance. Another conceivable explanation is that this transient period of immunosuppression may be the result of a modification of T-cell or macrophage function by blood factors or by other cellular components of host (immune complexes, suppressor substances) or treponemal (outer envelope, metabolic byproduct) origin generated during syphilitic infection. Effector lymphocytes may be suppressed by a ‘blocking factor’ analogous to that described in tumour immunity and in certain experimental systems (Hellstrom and Hellstrom, 1970) so that they are unable to differentiate or carry out effector function. In fact, inhibitory plasma or serum products have been demonstrated in syphilitic patients (Levene et al., 1969; Kantor, 1975) and in *T. pallidum* infected rabbits (Pavia et al., 1976; 1977c). In human syphilitic glomerulonephritis deposits of treponemal antigen-antitreponemal antibody complexes have been shown to contribute to tissue injury (Gambol and Reardon, 1975). Although suppressor cells have not been studied in syphilis they could be an important consequence of *T. pallidum* infection especially in the light of the recent finding of suppressor thymus-derived lymphocytes in patients infected with a variety of fungal organisms (Stobo et al., 1976). In our recent report (Pavia et al., 1977c) on experimental *T. pallidum* infection in rabbits the existence of suppressor-like function is suggested by a delay in the response to *T. pallidum* antigen(s) of unfraccionated lymphocytes in contrast to purified cells. Suppressor cells could inactivate immune lymphocytes which arise at foci of treponemal infection. A regulatory effect exerted on immunocompetent cells by any of the preceding conditions could also block the release of soluble mediators collectively known as lymphokines, one of which, migration inhibitory factor, encourages circulating blood monocytes to localise at sites of microbial invasion. The inability of effector cells such as lymphocytes and macrophages to be recruited to specific tissues in the diseased host and/or the capacity of *T. pallidum* to resist phagocytosis due to the organism’s innate biological properties may delay the early destruction of virulent treponemes and contribute to the widespread dissemination and establishment of spirochaetes in selected host sites. Then as the infection progresses to later stages a transition in the immune status of the host takes place. Normal T-lymphocyte function is restored leading to an effective cell-mediated response which could allow host defence mechanisms to participate in treponemical activities. From the sequence just presented it should be realised that cell-mediated phenomena in syphilis are by no means expressions of a single mechanism. Different cell categories (T-cells, B-cells, monocytes, macrophages, neutrophils) may be involved and their relative contribution to immunity may depend on the dynamic interaction of various factors induced by *T. pallidum* infection. If indeed cell-mediated immunity is an important element against spirochitic infection then investigations should be carried out in order to determine the extent of its protective role in this disease.

References


Charles S. Pavia, James D. Folds, and Joel B. Baseman


Pavia, C. S., Folds, J. D., and Baseman, J. B. (1977c). Selective in vitro response of thymus derived lymphocytes from Treponema pallidum infected rabbits. Infection and Immunology, 18, 603-611.


Cell-mediated immunity during syphilis. A review

Charles S. Pavia, James D. Folds and Joel B. Baseman

*Br J Vener Dis* 1978 54: 144-150
doi: 10.1136/sti.54.3.144

Updated information and services can be found at:
http://sti.bmj.com/content/54/3/144

**Email alerting service**

Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.

**Notes**

To request permissions go to:
http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions

To order reprints go to:
http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform

To subscribe to BMJ go to:
http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/